Against “Globalised Indifference”
Radio Reporters in the Face of the Refugee Crisis

2015 was the first year of the major migration crisis in Europe, the biggest one since the Second World War. According to Eurostat, in 2015 the EU Member States received in excess of 1.2 million applications for asylum, i.e. more than twice as much as in 2014. The topic of migration became a major talking point in the media and the sheer number of news pieces resulted in “moral panic” in European society, i.e. a spreading fear that the good of society was threatened. Initially, this was caused by the terrifying reports on the unimaginable numbers of immigrants storming EU borders. Television and computer screens were filled with images of a stream of desperate wanderers covering mile after mile in the hope of a better tomorrow. The images of children’s bodies washing ashore were heart-breaking. The footage of barbed-wire fences intended to protect Europe from an alien invasion was shocking. And, eventually, the issue of migration was linked to terrorism. It did not take long for in the social consciousness to start solidifying the immigrant stereotype: refugees as the symbol of destabilisation, discomfort, and threat.

According to Bauman, the media-fuelled panic led to “another tragedy”: care-free indifference and moral blindness. The shocking images of other people’s
tragedy quickly became old news and a “boring routine of normality.” The extensively presented human harm eventually stopped moving people as they became “tired of the refugee tragedy.” What remained was the presence of the newcomers among us, and the solidifying in the social consciousness category of that group of citizens as people who are unnecessary, redundant, and useless. The existence of that category became, in turn, a sign of the emerging division in society.5

To discuss that which is significant for our “here and now” constitutes the basic function of the report genre.6 Through personal fortunes its specialists offer recipients insight into the major contemporary problems, and they explain and organise reality. Yet that is not all. A reportage/feature is intended to evoke emotions and thus shock readers, viewers or listeners from their state of indifference.7 Those were the intentions that drove the authors of the radio documentaries on the refugee issue which I shall discuss in this article. The purpose of my text is to indicate that features – and radio features in particular – may support the process of building dialogue, and form a basis for communication and empathy between the representatives of various cultures.

“A reportage is born from a situation of encounter,” wrote Ryszard Kapuściński in Travels with Herodotus.8 Today, when new technology allows us to almost instantaneously exchange information, when journalism can be done without stepping out of one’s home or the editorial office, the reportage is probably the last genre which is based on a deep encounter with another person. Reportages/features often focus on people who are excluded, who suffered harm and pain.9 Increasingly often those include refugees, a fact which can be easily noticed by careful listeners, especially those tuning in to radio stations in the east of Poland.10

5 The number of people in favour of accepting refugees has been consistently falling in Poland since 2015: https://publicystyka.ngo.pl/w-liczbach-o-uchodzcach-w-polsce [accessed on: 3.01.2019].
6 Report – derived from the Latin reportare meaning to “offer, convey”. As for an in-depth reportage, which features the use of various means of sound expression, we use the terms “feature” and “documentary” interchangeably.
7 The issue of emotions in features and their functions were widely discussed by Edwin Brys, a Belgian radio reporter, in his theoretical studies. In this article, I shall refer to Brys’ lecture entitled Mechanics of Emotions, which he delivered during the international Prix Italia competition in 1993. I possess a copy of the text.
8 R. Kapuściński, Podróże z Herodotem, Społeczny Instytut Wydawniczy Znak, Kraków 2008, p. 77 [Unless indicated otherwise, English quotations were translated from Polish].
9 At this point, it is worth mentioning the multi-faceted study on the matter: K. Klimczak, Reportaże radiowe o krzywdzie i cierpieniu, Primum Verbum, Łódź 2011.
10 Refugee-themed features are developed mainly by radio stations in the east of Poland, as that is where centres for refugees who apply for refugee status are located.
A feature is an act of (journalistic, literary, creative) expression, the intention of which is to jolt the recipients from their state of indifference and evoke empathy and sympathy. The genre may play a particular role when multiculturalism becomes a new phenomenon in a social group. To “explain cultures” is the duty of a reporter, which Kapuściński indicated time and time again:

The point is to create relationships between cultures of not dependency or subjection, but of understanding and partnership. Only then might it be possible that accord and benevolence will prevail in our human family over all the hostility and conflicts. In my tiny microscopic section, I would like to help that happen, and that is why I write.

It seems that documentalist-reporters are the few people who can trigger changes in stereotypes on newcomers, help replace the digits of statistics with specific stories, and single out individual faces from the nameless crowds of migrants. The feature may become a tool for mutual discovery, and for building dialogue and accord between the representatives of different cultures or world views. The practitioners of the genre set out to “explain the world”, and that is why they focus on conflicts, be those political, social or personal. The major problems of today are presented through the prism of individual human fortunes. I am interested in how that reporting mission is fulfilled in its radio variant. I believe it is the audio feature that is particularly based on a close relationship between a reporter and a subject. My examples will include award-winning programmes or pieces on refugees which were created at the Lublin branch of the Polish Radio: Radio Lublin S.A.

As the research method, I applied the analysis and interpretation of radio features/documentaries. I analysed three programmes or pieces which focused on migrants and refugees who came to Poland. It should be noted that such content is rarely developed by the stations of Polish Radio. I selected features which were based on reliable material collected over many months and an interesting use of the medium of radio, all of which was recognised with prestigious awards (Eden za wąską rzeką – a 2003 award of the Stefan Batory Foundation and the Helsinki Foundation for Human Rights; Marmur i dzieci – Prix Bohemia 2017) or which spurred lively reactions among listeners (Przystanek Inny – the feature was re-

---

11 Kapuściński indicated thus understood role of the report the most comprehensively in his extended interview. Vide R. Kapuściński, Autoportret reportera, Społeczny Instytut Wydawniczy Znak, Kraków 2006.
12 Ibid., p. 21.
13 That is certainly related to the locations of the centres for refugees who seek refugee status in Poland, with the majority of the centres located in the regions of Lubelskie, Podhale and Mazovia.
broadcast several times on national airwaves and by the regional stations of Polish Radio). I am writing this article while fulfilling a dual role: of a radio journalist, and of a theoretician of radio.

The category of the “Other” proposed by Kapuściński is vital for my discussion and key for explaining the civilisational and cultural problems of contemporary Europe. In his book The Other, Kapuściński based his discussion on the philosophy of Emmanuel Lévinas, known as the philosophy of dialogue or the philosophy of the encounter. That stream focusses on the matters of humans (the “I”) and their relations with other humans, “the Other”. An encounter with “the Other” is the highest possible experience. Its content should consist of dialogue. The purpose of dialogue is mutual understanding, which in turn is supposed to lead to establishing close relations with others.

While for Lévinas and other philosophers of dialogue (Martin Buber, Franz Rosenzweig, fr. Józef Tischner) “the other” was simply another person with whom one enters a relation, for Kapuściński “the Other” was someone “non-white”, a “non-European”. Kapuściński emphasised that every human is an individual, a personality, yet also every human is the carrier of race and culture. It is clear that over the centuries people have exacted too much harm on each other to now welcome “the Other” with open arms. The initial reaction to “the Other” is restraint, distrust, or even aversion and hostility. Yet an encounter with “the Other” is one of the major challenges of the 21st century. Such an approach is often promoted by the creators of features/documentaries – audio features/documentaries in particular.

The characteristics of radio feature

The artistic audio feature is a genre that is hard to define, as it straddles the borders between non-fiction, stage play, film and music; being a narrative work, it assumes the form of a closed composition with strongly defined aesthetic features. “[...] a good radio feature is, just like radio drama, an entity which belongs to art,” according to Elżbieta Pleszkun-Olejniczakowa, the creator of Łódzka Szkoła Ra-

---

14 Since 1998, I have recorded around twenty radio reports.
18 The distinctive features of radio reportage were discussed extensively by Kinga Klimczak in the paper “Reportaż radiowy – definicja i podział”, Acta Universitatis Lodzienis. Folia Litteraria Polonica 2011, issue 1(14), pp. 123–133.
And like most works of art or culture texts, its task is to evoke emotional reactions in recipients, e.g.: affection, admiration, anger, or opposition. Irena Piłatowska, the chief of the Reportage and Documentary Studio at the Polish Radio, seemed to share that position, as she argued that audio stories mainly affect the feeling and the emotions of listeners, and only later does reflection come. Edwin Brys, a renowned Belgian reporter, referred to the authors of audio stories as “the mechanics of emotions.” He indicated the opportunities offered by the medium of radio in that respect. And he did not mean simply producing cheap “tear squeezers”, but an attempt to draw recipients into a deeper perception of a work of art. Since the matter of a work of art is real life, then the deeper perception will surely help recipients develop their emotional intelligence, and the ability to understand how other people feel. The exact opposite of an emotional experience is the lack thereof, i.e. indifference. And non-indifference is the main objective of the creators of features. Non-indifference, the understanding of the worlds of the subjects, refugees in this case, and the mechanisms behind their life choices—that is what features would like to be the takeaway for listeners. The entire creative process is subordinate to that end.

From the point of view of a professional, I can argue that in the creative process the author of a radio feature/documentary has four basic tasks: engage in an in-depth encounter with the subject, discuss the problem, interpret people’s attitudes (by specific dramatic choices), and react, i.e. defend the more vulnerable.

**Eden za wąską rzeką**

I wish to go back to 1999, when after leaving Łódź, my hometown, I came to Lublin and I started my collaboration with the Regional Station of Polish Radio: Lublin S.A. radio. Having the opportunity to see the reality of the Borderland, I noticed a phenomenon completely unknown to the inhabitants of central Poland, i.e. the illegal crossing of the Bug River – a border river – by foreigners from Asia. I was surprised by the extent of the phenomenon. Not a week went by without the local media reporting on new arrests of the citizens of such countries as Afghanistan, Iraq and Sri Lanka, who, using dinghies, rafts, or even tire inner tubes, tried to enter the territory of the Republic of Poland. For many Poland was supposed to be an intermediate country on their way West. There were also cases of people who after being arrested tried to apply for refugee status in Poland, though that was more common specifically at border crossings. What spurred them to take such risks and leave their homelands? What could our country have had to offer them? What emotions did the newcomers trigger in the inhabitants of the Borderland? Such

---

21 E. Brys, op. cit.
questions came to my mind when I was embarking on developing a feature report entitled *Eden za wąską rzeką* [Eden behind a narrow river], which I developed in 2002–2003 after being awarded the Jacek Stwora scholarship.

The piece was an audio monograph on refugees in Poland, a country which on the eve its accession to the EU was poorly prepared for accepting refugees – in legal, procedural and organisational terms. As I embarked on it, I was, as always, considering how the use of the audio medium could add something new to the discussion. How should I utilise the specificity of work at a radio station to introduce something new to the discourse on aliens? My main task became to find distinctive subjects who would not be afraid to tell their stories in their own voices. That was no easy task as each and every element of the refugee procedure is in some sense an act of denunciation of one’s homeland. That meant the interviewees would have to take huge risks. At that stage already, there was a clear advantage of the radio medium over television or a written text. My interlocutors, who were waiting in centres for foreigners for their refugee status applications to be reviewed, would never had consented to speak in front of a video camera. It was emotional for them to talk about their traumatic experiences to a reporter during an intimate face-to-face meeting with a voice recorder; it offered them an opportunity to focus completely and formulate their stories. My many visits to the centres for foreigners in Lublin, Chelm and Dębak gave me the opportunity to record subjects in so-called ultra close-up, which one can achieve by recording not just the verbal content, but also all the other non-verbal aspects of speech, such as the tone and strength of voice, accent, and the pitch and pace of one’s speech. Thus, in the *Eden za wąską rzeką* feature, I was able to present three completely different refugee stories: of a professor’s family from Basra (Iraq), two teenagers from China, and a teacher from Chechnya. I also presented the work of border patrol officers patrolling the banks of the Bug, and the dramatic moment of capturing illegal immigrants constituted a compositional frame for the piece. A major element of it were scenes with the inhabitants of the villages on the Bug who, like a Greek chorus, commented on the events which they had witnessed or of which they had heard. From scraps of their comments one could learn that illegal smuggling of people over the border river was an organised business on a huge scale. An illegal business which even entailed the crime of murdering disloyal collaborators. The storylines in the feature were maintained in parallel – like in a film they progressed from one character to another, from one setting to another. The main dramatic axis was the non-linearly depicted three refugee stories. In their specific scenes, one could learn what everyday life in a centre for foreigners looked like. Next, how the subjects reached Poland, and, finally, to be surprised by the direct reasons behind their leaving their homelands. Thus, in the climax of the show one could learn that the family from

Iraq were Christians who decided to seek shelter in Europe from the radicalism of Shia groups. The young Chinese were the so-called illegal children (in China, parents were only allowed to have one child), and the teacher from Chechnya left her village after the return of her student, who had been tortured by Russians. Her mission was to disseminate knowledge on the cruelties of the Second Chechen War. There is one more important element in this piece which is not so much an account of the situation of refugees in Poland but a universal statement on the phenomenon which is as old as humanity: exile, fleeing, and emigration. Extracting something universal from the presented story is supposed to help recipients identify with it, develop their own opinions on the problem, and become non-indifferent. In fact, the situations of the Iraqis, the Chinese or the Chechens was not that much different from our “here and now.” That element of the program’s structure were fragments of the Bible read by the professor from Basra on the situation of exiles (beginning with those expelled from Paradise). One might consider this to be a rather risky decision if the author had not actually encountered the Iraqi family reading the Bible aloud. Fragments of the Old Testament read in Arabic, i.e. in the language of Islam (with a Polish voice-over), were particularly expressive. Behold the aliens, newcomers, praying just like us, Poles, a nation 90% of whom declare their attachment to Catholicism. The piece’s concluding fragment of the Bible, with the potent words: “For I was hungry and you gave me something to eat,” put side by side with the scene of the brutal arrest of immigrants on the Bug indicated that the story was directed at anyone to whom Christian values were dear, and it should lead to actions involving openness and intercultural dialogue.

**Przystanek: Inny**

The lack of openness and intercultural dialogue was discussed in a later documentary recorded ten years later: Przystanek: Inny [Stopover: The Other] by Agnieszka Czyżewska-Jacquemet. It described an art initiative during which recordings of foreigners reading announcement on the incoming stops were played on public transport, through the PA. The initiative lasted two weeks and was intended to help the inhabitants of Lublin realise that their city was home to a multicultural community.

After Poland’s accession to the EU, its eastern border was tightened. The phenomenon of illegal immigration to our country was rare. People declaring the intention to acquire refugee status attempted to officially cross the border and began the refugee procedure already at border crossings. During the Second Chechen War (1999–2009), more and more representatives of that nation began appearing in our cities; Lublin also received a steady inflow of Ukrainians. At the same time many Poles also decided to emigrate, but for economic reasons. All the avail-

---

able facts indicated that the level of tolerance in the border town should have been high. Yet it turned out that many inhabitants of Lublin were outraged at the fact that for two weeks public transport vehicles replayed the names of stops read out by people with a foreign accent, classified as eastern. Some strong voices of opposition emerged, while in the media there was a heated debate on the point of such an initiative, which caused irritation rather than integration. The Przystanek: Inny reportage consisted of three parallel story lines: fragments of the recording session with refugees from Chechnya, including articulation exercises; the reporter travelling on buses and talking to the inhabitants about the new bus stop announcements; and, finally, conversations with Chechens on their life in Lublin. The most dynamic scenes recorded on board of the public transport revealed how important the **audiosphere** was for one’s identification with a place. The new announcements read in imperfect Polish in female, male and children’s voices knocked passengers out of their routine perceptions and disrupted the course of their indolent thoughts. The surprising sound of the announcements evoked questions: Who were those people? Why were they assigned that task? Did their audio presence entail discomfort among the listeners, or did it raise their interest? What about physical presence? Am I aware of the fact that I live in a multicultural town? Can I create a community with the Other? Whom do I allow into the community? A brief passing announcement heard on the bus gave the inhabitants an opportunity to verify their often only declaratory openness and tolerance. The issue of active listening was discussed extremely interestingly in the piece/programme. What happens when one stops “hearing” and starts “listening”. As it turned out, a sound which a person hears rather than ignores links them with a place and time where they were at that time. Listening is the key to comprehension. **Active listening** always results in understanding. Only through understanding is it possible to develop a bond.24 An additional layer of meaning was offered by the scenes which depicted the efforts of the foreigners to ensure the best rendition of the difficult to read Polish names of streets – they became a metaphor of the adaptive efforts of newcomers. Did those efforts lead to the expected outcome? Some of the answers which the reporter received while recording her material would leave anyone doubtful:

“I am outraged at that. All nations cherish their languages. This is Polish and there should be a Polish announcer [...] I don’t know why in those announcements a foreign language were introduced.”

“Is that the reason we have to employ them?”

24 Excellent lectures on the loss of the skill of “active listening” and its consequences were presented at TED.com platform by Julian Treasure: https://www.ted.com/talks/julian_treasure_5_ways_to_listen_better [accessed on: 5.01.2019].
“It would be better to introduce English or German, not that broken Polish.”

“Why do we need to adjust to everyone? [...] In Poland, I would like to feel Polish.”

In the documentary, a very important role is played by the author, who was the “visible reporter”, inquisitive, who asked questions to both the newcomers and the locals, and the originator of the artistic initiative in the town’s buses. The young artist, a representative of socially engaged art, representing a small group of those who were not indifferent, became the intermediary between the two worlds. She intended to bring them closer to each other, to link them. That was supposed to happen through the means of artistic provocation based on the use of sound. The reporter was also an intermediary, who used the same material. Through her questions, she provoked her interlocutors, i.e. the recipients of the audio announcements, to engage in an interpretative effort, which in turn enabled them to see more in their surrounding reality and better know themselves. Kapuściński’s remarks in The Other again come to mind: “to better know oneself a person has to get to know the Others because They are the mirror in which we can see our reflections.”

Marmur i dzieci
Since the outbreak of the First Chechen War (1994), the route from the Caucasus through Moscow to Brest (Belarus) has been a tried and tested route for all escapees seeking refuge in Europe outside the borders of the Russian Federation. Within fifteen years the route was covered by over twenty thousand Chechens, who found refuge in Poland and other European states. Yet between May and June 2016 limitations were introduced at the Belarusian-Polish border crossing of Brest-Terespol. In a period of a few months, dozens of refugees from Chechnya made forty or more attempts to cross the border. They were turned away by the Polish border patrol under the pretence of not having visas, despite the fact they stated that they were refugees and wished to apply for international protection. The immigrants rejected at the border went back to a station in Brest, which was referred to as Little Chechnya for this reason. They lived there, they slept there, and ate there; their children attended a democratic school managed by Marina Hulia, a charismatic community activist. In 2016, the issue was widely reported in the Polish and European media. The Brest-Terespol border crossing was visited by the representatives of international human rights organisations, and by lawyers and psychologists. Despite this, no one was able to change the position of Polish authorities, who justified the situation by arguing there was a need to block a new route used by terrorists and a wave of illegal immigrants to enter

Europe.\textsuperscript{26} It is necessary to jump through many hoops to acquire a Belarusian press visa and permits to conduct recordings on topics related to big politics. That was why press journalists and photojournalists went undercover to document the situation in Brest. It is virtually impossible for television teams to acquire permits. Agnieszka Czyżewska-Jacquemet and I were able to acquire a visa under the pretense of a planned reportage on Ryszard Kapuściński in his family town of Pinsk (the reportage was actually developed).

Our work on the piece which we titled \textit{Marmur i dzieci}\textsuperscript{27} [Marble and children] was for us one of the most important reporter experiences. Over the course of the few days we spent at the station in Brest, we listened to the refugees’ moving stories of persecution and violence in a country where officially everything was constantly getting better. What was surprising was the fact that the refugees were willing to talk. Or rather: they yearned for someone to listen to them. But they refused to have their photographs taken. Radio and its intimacy\textsuperscript{28} once again proved helpful. Most of all, however, \textit{Marmur i dzieci} was a universal story on exile, which is mainly caused by fear and concern for the future of the youngest. \textbf{Children’s voices}: their calls, laughter, and cries filled the story on Little Chechnya, forming its special audiosphere. Those sounds were intended to build an emotional bridge between the characters in the feature and the listeners, the representatives of a completely different culture, of another world. The aim was for us to begin perceiving “the Other” as someone from among us, since the love for children and fear for their future are universal emotions understood in every part of the world. That completed the encounter discussed by fr. Józef Tischner, one of the philosophers of dialogue:

\begin{quote}
For people to meet they must have a common layer of an encounter. I do not mean a location but rather a “background for an encounter.” [...] That is the broadly understood sphere of the principles and values experienced by people. That sphere establishes the hierarchy [...] A dialogue can be successful only if our hierarchies are similar or when they can become alike.\textsuperscript{29}
\end{quote}

\textit{Marmur i dzieci} is a piece in which we, the authors, became part of the depicted world. While wearing concealed microphones, we decided to accompany immigrants in their attempts to cross the border. We rode the train with them. We

\textsuperscript{26} Those mainly included statements by Mariusz Błaszczak, the minister of internal affairs, he made in July 2016, e.g. https://www.tvn24.pl/wiadomosci-z-kraju,3/szef-mswia-mariusz-blaszczak-o-czeczenach-na-polskiej-granicy,672450.html [accessed on: 5.01. 2019].

\textsuperscript{27} https://radio.lublin.pl/news/58d1298d83ba889b0e3c9869 [accessed on: 5.01. 2019].


accompanied them in the queue to the interrogation room until our presence was uncovered. And even then, we did not relent and asked the officers questions about the instances of Poland violating international conventions. The feature was extremely emotional. We assumed the role of students in relation to our interlocutors – the masters of life experiences. We assumed the dialogical attitude propagated by Kapuściński: “Stop. Next to you, there is another person. Encounter him. Such an encounter is the highest experience.”

“The Other” is our master, and our relationship with them should be a motion towards Goodness. That “motion towards Goodness” first occurs at the level of the reporter, i.e. the character, and later, when the piece is broadcast, it is transferred onto the character-recipient relation.

Conclusion

To assume the attitude of a student, to “conduct the act of conversation”, to take responsibility for the Other – those are the tasks of contemporary reporters. Or maybe those are the tasks of all conscientious Europeans. What Pope Francis said during his visit to Lampedusa, an island which has become the symbol of the migrant crisis, was intended for all of us:

The culture of comfort, which makes us think only of ourselves, makes us insensitive to the cries of other people, makes us live in soap bubbles which, however lovely, are insubstantial; they offer a fleeting and empty illusion which results in indifference to others; indeed, it even leads to the globalization of indifference. In this globalised world, we have fallen into globalised indifference.

Radio reporters belong to a small group of people reacting to “global indifference.” They discuss the world using the voices of those who usually remain silent. Let us hope that those voices can break the bubble of indifference to human suffering.

Bibliography


Brys E., Mechanics of Emotions, a lecture delivered during the international Prix Italia competition in 1993. I possess a copy of the text.


Internet resources
https://radio.lublin.pl/news/58d1298d83ba889b0e3c9869 [accessed on: 5.01. 2019].
https://www.ted.com/talks/julian_treasure_5_ways_to_listen_better [accessed on: 5.01.2019].
Przeciwko „zglobalizowanej obojętności”
Reportażysta radiowy wobec problematyki uchodźczej

Streszczenie


Słowa kluczowe: migracja, reportaż, inny, filozofia dialogu, użycie dźwięku

Against “Globalised Indifference”
Radio Reporters in the Face of the Refugee Crisis

Summary

Since it intensified in 2015, the migration crisis has become one of the major topics of media coverage. With time those numerous pieces resulted in society becoming indifferent to the plight of migrants. The newcomers, stereotypically treated as aliens, became a group of the unnecessary and unneeded, which then started to bear social tension and divisions. The author of the article intends to indicate that reportage/feature, radio reportage in particular, is one of the methods for building dialogue between cultures. In following the remarks of Ryszard Kapuściński and Emmanuel Levinas, the author noted that an encounter with “the Other” is one of the major challenges of the 21st century. The three analysed programmes seem
to prove the fact that the medium of radio may fulfil a special role in overcoming “globalised indifference.”

**Keywords:** migration, reportage, the other, philosophy of dialogue, use of sounds

**Katarzyna Michalak** – Ph.D. candidate at the Faculty of Political Science, Marie Curie-Skłodowska University in Lublin, a reporter of Polish Radio Lublin radio, promoter of the art of active listening. She professes in the *feature*, i.e. artistic reportage – a genre on the borderline between journalism, literature, music and film. She is the author of nearly two hundred pieces broadcast by the stations of Polish Radio, German radio stations, and Czech Radio. In 2011–2015, she was the Polish representative at the EBU Features Group. In 2011–2018, she was the manager of the Feature Department of Polish Radio Lublin. She received important national and international awards, e.g.: Prix Italia, Prix Europa, Prix Marulić, Prix Bohemia, Grand Press, Złoty Mikrofon.