

Dorota GORZELANY,
Muzeum Narodowe w Krakowie

Patrycja MATUSIAK
Uniwersytet Śląski

CARTHAGE IMAGINED. FROM GIOVANNI PASTRONE'S 'CABIRIA' (1914) TO 'GAME OF THRONES' (2012)

KARTAGINA WYOBRAŻONA. OD *CABIRII* GIOVANNIEGO PASTRONE (1914)
DO *GRY O TRON* (2012)

Celem artykułu jest przybliżenie historiofotycznego obrazu wyobrazonego Kartaginy i Kartagińczyków oraz pokazanie, w jaki sposób wymyślone historie bazują na wizerunku antyku istniejącym w zbiorowej świadomości, jakie motywy były inspiracją dla twórców filmu i serialu (motywy historyczne, ale i ważne dla tła np. architektura – w ‘Cabirii’ punicka świątynia Molocha i wszechobecne egipskie zapożyczenia, w ‘Grze o tron’ XIX-wieczne obrazy J.M.W. Turnera), w jaki sposób za pomocą kodu antycznego mówiono o współczesnej ‘Cabirii’ polityce (starcia pacyfistów z nacjonalistami nawołującymi do podboju Afryki), czy wniósł coś do filmu D’Annunzianizm i jak ‘Cabiria’ wpisywała się w nurt historyczno-romański. Szczegółowa analiza dokonana została na dwóch poziomach – filologicznym oraz archeologicznym (obejmującym elementy architektoniczne budujące strukturę urbanistyczną, dekorację rzeźbiarską, wyposażenie wnętrz i przedmioty użytkowe oraz części stroju).

Słowa kluczowe: Kartagina, historiofotia, recepcja antyku, ‘Cabiria’, ‘Gra o tron’, J.M.W. Turner

Unlike Greek and Roman antiquity, Carthage is slightly underrepresented in antiquity-themed films. It appears in *Cabiria* (1914) and one may notice a certain resemblance in the city of Qarth featuring in the second season of HBO hit series *Game of Thrones*. Apart from the above Hannibal appears several times – as title character in 1959 *Annibale* played by Victor Mature, in *Scipione l'Africano* of 1937 and in *Jupiter's Darling* of 1955 (see also: García Morcillo 2015: 136–137). Other images of Carthage and Hannibal can be found in comics: in a web-comic *Hannibal goes to Rome*, created by Brendan McGinley and Mauro Vargas (since 2008 there have been 12 volumes, the story so far finishes in 217 BC), in comics *Barca* by Michel Suro and Simon Rocca (1996), sadly, only in one volume called *L'otage d'Hamilcar*, featuring First Punic War (the second volume was supposed

to be called *La Chair du Moloch*), in *Hannibal the Great* by Ken Sibanda and John H. Sibley (so far the first of three volumes came out in 2013), in *Metauro* by Michele Petrucci (2008), in *Occhi di lupo. Un'avventura ai tempi di Annibale*, written by Giovanni Brizzi himself and drawn by Sergio Tisselli in 2004; in series *Les voleurs de Carthage* by Appollo and Tranquerelle (2014) and *Carthage* by G. Lassablière and F. David (2010–2011); in second volume of *Roma* by É. Adam, P. Boisserie, D. Convard and L. Erbetta (2014); in volumes of *Alix* by Jacques Martin: 3 – *L'Île Maudite* (1957), 13 – *Le spectre de Carthage* (1967) and 30 – *La conjuration de Baal* (2011), as well as in manga: *Heureka* by Hitoshi Iwaaki of 2002 and *Ad Astra. Scipio to Hannibal* by Mihachi Kagano of 2011. Compared with other antiquity-themed visualisations the above list is hardly impressive.

One must not forget Gustave Flaubert's 1862 historical novel *Salammô* (Pelletier-Hornby 1995: 138–144), which tells a story of the Mercenary War of 3rd century BCE (Hoyos 2011). Although two years after it had been published it got onto the List of Prohibited Books, it was a constant source of inspiration for painters, sculptors, composers, filmmakers¹ and writers. In 2010, Éditions Glénat, a French publishing house specializing in comics, brought out a collective edition of *Salammô*, created by Philippe Druillet² and previously published in three volumes by Dargaud publishing house (1981, 1986 and 1988). Even though the plot is based on Flaubert's work, it is at the same time a continuation of the adventures of Lone Sloane, a character created by Druillet. The artist proved to be quite inventive as he moved the place of action from North Africa to outer space. Despite such exotic vision, Druillet showed the original frames of the comic in Musée National de Carthage, in 1987, as part of the exhibition put together by Mission Française en Tunisie, le Ministère des Affaires Culturelles, l'Institut National d'Archéologie et d'Art, and l'Office National du Tourisme de Tunisie

In 1988 Hayden White in article 'Historiography and historiophoty' published in 'The American Historical Review' (White 1988: 1193–1199 and White 2014: 255–266) created the term *historiophoty* which regards the way history is presented in pictures. By coining up this new term in analogy to historiographia White highlights the difference between the written and the imagistic representation of the past. The historiophotic presentation of Carthage is aim of our paper.

The first such representation can be found in *Cabiria*, a film by Giovanni Pastrone of 1914, which is a story of a Roman named Cabiria, kidnapped as a child by Carthage pirates and left in the care of princess Sophonisba. The story has loose connections with Punic Wars and was inspired by Gustave Flaubert's *Salammô* (García Morcillo 2015: 147–152). Gabrielle D'Annunzio was responsible for creating the historical vision of the film. The picture was innovative

¹ About adaptations of *Salammô* see in: García Morcillo 2015: 136–137 and 141–147.

² Polish edition: Egmont Polska 2016.

in its production, it also introduced a character of Maciste, a superhero, who later appeared in many films (also in B-movies, e.g. *Maciste contro il vampiro*, *Maciste contro i mostri*) until 1960s.

What is really interesting here is the way the history is imagined and presented, which follows the models of so called *specialità italiana*, of the beginnings of Italian cinema, which frequently used ancient history themes (*Quo vadis* 1912, *Odyssey* 1911, *Anthony and Cleopatra* 1913, *Fall of Troy* 1911) and made numerous references to the greatness of Rome. It must be stressed, however, that between 1913 and 1915 Italian cinematography enjoyed the biggest growth (Miczka 2009: 29 sqq). Giovanni Pastrone (a.k.a. Piero Fosco) made two more antiquity-themed films: a short called Julius Caesar (*Giulio Cesare*) in 1909, and 'Fall of Troy' (*La caduta di Troia*) in 1911 and two more featuring Maciste, the superhero. *Cabiria* was written by Gabriele D'Annunzio, a writer much sought after by film producers. Between 1911 and 1920 15 of his works were adapted for cinema making up a series of psychological dramas 'set in the mansions of rich aristocrats living their death-marked love stories' (Miczka 2009: 33). What Tadeusz Miczka calls *D'Annunzianism* was a certain aesthetic, one of decadence and it evolved into the original Italian cinematographic style. D'Annunzio also became the co-author of an 'indecent' film genre, his name is linked to a 1913 film called *Saffo e Priapo*, one of the first soft-porn movies.

In *Cabiria*, the actors cast as Romans used different acting techniques and body expressions that those playing the Carthaginians and the Numids. As a result, according to Tadeusz Miczka the Romans appeared as victorious warriors while Carthaginians demonstrated demonic if not barbaric qualities. Experts in early Italian cinematography stress the propaganda appeal of *Cabiria*, which was shot in times of conflict between the pacifists and nationalists calling for the invasion of Africa (Miczka 2009: 36; Dorgerloh 2013: 235).

The set design in the film *Cabiria* was carried out in a monumental form and with a flourish admirable in so early a film production. This concerns both the scenes in Roman Catania and Syracuse, as well as the North African cities, Punic Carthage and Numidian Cirta. The visualisation of the latter two cities was done in a similar way, through enclosing the city space in fortifications with a polygonal and isonomic style of wall, resembling late medieval/early modern solutions. The set design of Carthage shows a broad spectrum of urban spaces – the sanctuary, streets, public buildings interiors, palaces and gardens. Despite the archaeological excavation done in Carthage in the last quarter of the 19th century, it is difficult to refer to the original Punic architectural monuments, since they had been destroyed. As part of the specific cultural associations with Northern Africa and the Middle East made in the early 20th century, the set design contains numerous Middle Eastern, Egyptian, as well as Roman and Greek elements. Although this combination is factually incorrect, it nevertheless reflects the influences visible in Carthaginian art over the centuries, with the Middle Eastern elements are among the rarest.

In the second episode of the film, a group of children – Cabiria among them – are threatened with death by being sacrificed to Moloch, a god with an imprecise function, more connected with the ritual of sacrifice rather than a specific figure from an ancient pantheon (Moscatti 1968: 166). The fantastic and awe-inspiring architectural and sculptural form of the temple of Moloch (26:53) is an evocative visualisation of the description found in Diodorus Siculus (20, 14, 6)³ and can only be loosely connected with the Mannerist Sacro Bosco sculptures in Bomarzo (Dorgerloh 2013: 239). There are no iconographic sources to be cited, not only to determine the form of this specific sanctuary, but to even confirm its existence, assuming an association of Moloch with Ba'al, who was worshipped in Carthage. This is because within the Tophet, only burial sites and votive stelae have been found, decorated with, among others, the motif used in the movie in a spectacular way – it is the symbol of an open hand (Lipiński 1988: 162–182), referring to the act of prayer to the god Ba'al-Hammon and to the gesture of a blessing (24:51).

In the film the arms of the winged Moloch are stretched downwards. The priest does not put the sacrificial children into Moloch's arms but into an opening in its stomach filled with fire. When closing the pit the child rolled down into the stomach blazing with flames. After closing the pit the flames blazed through the statue's open mouth. And last but not least one must mention the three subsequently lit eyes.

Sacrifices of children made in Carthage (Moscatti 1968: 165–167; Lipiński 2013: 96–97; Shelby Brown 1992: 147–167), connected with the *molk* sacrifice, archaeologically proven by the examination of so called 'tofet de Salamambo' (Fantar 2002: 13–24), were originally made of newborns. Since 4th century BCE the sacrifices were made of children aged 1–4 (Lipiński 2013: 96). The children depicted in the film, dramatically kicking and dangling their feet, appear to be much older than one.

The Moloch of *Cabiria* is impressive because of the opening in its stomach, which forms the passage between the temple and the furnace, the world of the living and the world of the dead. The flames coming out of its stomach are synchronised with the creature's three eyes which emit flashes of light. Moloch's arms are slightly bent down, its palms facing its knees. The triple eyes are mirrored in the image of Moloch's giant head, whose mouth is also the entrance to the temple. This is a clear reference to Flaubert's vision of Moloch. In chapter seven of *Salammbô* there is a short description of Moloch which tells us that the statue was made entirely of iron with a head of a bull facing upward and a manly chest with numerous openings. Its wings were spread over the wall, long arms reached the ground and three black stones with yellow circles around

³ 'There was in their city a bronze image of Cronus, extending its hands, palms up and sloping toward the ground, so that each of the children when placed thereon rolled down and fell into a sort of gaping pit filled with fire' [transl. Russel M. Geer].

represented its pupils (Flaubert 2008: 99). Also, chapter 13 brings a description children being sacrificed; their arms and legs were bound, they were placed on the statue's hands and later lifted to disappear into the smoke coming out of the opening so that one could have an impression that they disappear into a cloud (Flaubert 2008: 224–225).

Moloch and the port are two very important elements of the image of Carthage, they are also the two things the film and comics authors referred to. Although *Cabiria* features the image of Moloch, as fascinating and terrifying as it may be, the authors did not venture to show the port. It might have proven too difficult, even though special effects employed to depict the sea battle demonstrate a certain degree of sophistication, or, what seems more likely, there might not have been such need. However, the port appears in the comics; their authors modelled it on the existing graphic reconstructions (Ameling 2004: 89; Fantar 1995: illustration of J.-C. Golvin on the cover).

Other architectural forms seen in the film use elements commonly associated with Carthage through Hannibal's military tactics, such as the monumental supports in the form of sculptures of elephants (40:07), but mainly with the East and the Indus Valley: a candlestick in the shape of a unicorn, reminiscent of a decorative motif that occurs, among others, on the Ishtar Gate in Babylon (Kunze 1995: 50f.), the wall in the background of the portico is painted with architectural elements and a galloping rider, which can be read as a reference to the reliefs depicting hunting in Assyrian art.⁴ The arched harp standing in the foreground, decorated with a head with a necklace-collar is an instrument with a Sumerian provenance (Galpin 1929: 108–123), but it was also often used in Egyptian culture, much like the fans visible in the scene correspond to the typical Egyptian fans known from the ruler's iconography. Visible in the arrangement of the chamber of Sophonisba (42:03) – the Carthaginian princess who wears dress and jewellery of Eastern influence, but more typical of the 19th century – are the influences of various cultures: the checker and diamond patterns in wall paintings reproduce Egyptian motifs, the bed refers to Roman models, the box for feminine trifles – to the Egyptian form, the two alabastra resemble significantly enlarged vessels of this type produced by Corinthian workshops up until the 6th century BCE, while *aryballoï* and *lekythoi* are visible in subsequent scenes. A faience double-spouted vessel in the shape of a Nile deity, made in the workshops of Rhodes in the 7th century BCE, significantly larger than archaeological finds, is used as a ceremonial pitcher during the betrothal of Sophonisba and Syphax, the king of Cirta, at the beginning of the fifth episode of the film (1:05:50) (Bulas 1935: pl. 2[56]4).

⁴ Fragment of the stone panels from the North Palace of Ashurbanipal, Nineveh, 669–630 BCE, British Museum ME 124872; ME 124873; ME 124874; ME 124875: http://www.britishmuseum.org/research/collection_online/collection_object_details/collection_image_gallery.aspx?assetId=36102001&objectId=366951&partId=1 [accessed 08.02.2016]; Cf. Dorgerloh 2013: 241f.

The numerous Egyptian amulets found during excavations in Carthage prove that the townspeople eagerly protected themselves using foreign gods and religious symbols. At the Inn of the Striped Monkey (1:14:20), stands an unusual-sized figure of Pataikos⁵, a dwarf deity whose figure was commonly worn as amulets. Other design elements are a set of objects from different cultures: despite the well-known characteristic Hellenistic Punic amphorae, the Inn of the Striped Monkey (17:03) uses the Roman amphora from the 4th century CE,⁶ while the pitchers match the Punic shape (Cintas 1950: pl. 57.18–19 (1:43:56 – painting on the wall), 83.169 (17:3 – oinochoe)). The Roman Fulvius Axilla, drinking wine at the inn, and his slave Maciste have succumbed to barbarisation. Fulvius wears a traveling hat and medieval high boots (16:37), as if he was a non-Roman, while in the following scenes (22:31), he puts on a tunic over his armour (although this is explained by this task as a spy). Maciste, on the other hand, wears a leopard skin loincloth and a toga nonchalantly slung over his arm.

For comparison of the nature and quality of the Carthage set design, it is worth looking at the arrangement of the second African city and the Sicilian city of Catania. On the walls of the palaces in the neighbouring Numidian Cirta (1:20:41) are reliefs that replicate Egyptian patterns known from monumental temple sculptures, as well as decoration of utilitarian objects. An architectural layout similar to the Carthage palace hall have been used here, except that the elephant statues have been replaced by monumental sculptures of Sekhmet, the lioness goddess (correctly Dorgerloh 2013: 245). Reliefs in a register layout show various loosely associated subjects: a scene of a sacrifice, a representation of a gryphon attacking a lying deer, an enthroned ruler protected by a deity, the winged serpent guard common in funeral iconography, and bulls being led to a sacrifice. On one of the walls of the chamber (1:37:47) is a relief representation of musician women referring to the decorations in the tomb of Nakht in Thebes (15th century BCE) (Mekhitarian 1992: 33), while right in front of the wall is a figure of the bull Apis, supporting the figure of the sitting god. On the left side of the frame, the inner surface of the window is decorated with a scarab and ureus motif, while the wall next to the window is another relief scene of a sacrifice and a scene (1:36:58) of a sacrificial killing of a bull in front of the ruler. The scarab motif is repeated several times, also in the unusual combination of hands radially extending from its head, as a painted wall decoration in a worship space, next to the image of a deity referring to Egyptian Osiris (Śliwa 1970: 21–37, n. 1, fig. 13) (1:45:02) as well as in the decoration of the fortifications. The motif of the solar disc with hands (1:28:49), characteristic of the Amarna period of Egyptian art, adorns the back of the throne in a form close to the Roman sellium with armrests

⁵ It is not figure of Bes as says Dorgerloh 2013: 239 relating to Fiorina 2006: 298. Cf. Śliwa 1987: 184, cat. 202.

⁶ Cf. Dressel 23 Amphora (<http://archaeologydataservice.ac.uk/> [accessed 08.02.2016]).

in the shape of lions, animals belonging to the universal Eastern iconography of the ruler. In the throne room, the supports show yet another motif typical of Egyptian art – a bundle of lotus. Beside the support is a metal vessel, its form once again referring to the archaic clay Corinthian alabastra.

In terms of cultural authenticity, the most accurate is the reconstruction of the villa Batto (3:54) at the foot of Mt. Etna in Catania. However, the patterns of extensive villa layouts used here come from the early Empire period (Ward-Perkins 1981: 185–210; Frazer 1998: 29–42), which puts them much later than the action set at the end of the 3rd century BCE. In the early scenes of the film we see a portico of the Ionic order, with stairs leading from it to two more symmetrically placed porticoes. This is an unusual project for Roman villas, even suburban ones, where rooms were predominantly placed on one level, as can be seen in the vast villa in Oplontis (Fergola 2004). The differentiation of levels does not occur in villas presented in wall paintings; it is, however, characteristic of modern layouts. The sculptural decoration of the villa Batto porticoes is formed by elements typical of a period no earlier than the 1st century CE. They are copies of Greek sculptures, the models for which can be found in the Vatican Museum, mainly in the Chiaramonti Gallery. In the background of the first frame of the side portico of the villa is the sculpture of a man, who may represent Apollo, a Roman copy from the 2nd century CE.⁷ Another, wider frame from the interior of the second portico (4:16) opposite the first one shows two sculptures in the foreground and a marble Neo-Attic volute krater, a simplified copy of a krater from the Galleria dei Candelabri, dated 30–20 BCE.⁸ The statue visible from the rear on the left is the already mentioned sculpture of Apollo, while on the right side there is a statue of Artemis in the type of a copy of a Hellenistic sculpture, found in Hadrian's Villa in Tivoli.⁹ Depending on the take in the film (4:47), there are inconsistencies in the decorations of the two side porticoes – the intercolumnium with the statue of Apollo, visible at the beginning of the film, is empty in later scenes. We see a symmetrically placed marble volute krater, but later in the film, the statue of Artemis next to it is missing. It appears only in the earthquake scenes (10:43) – despite the laws of statics, neither Artemis nor the krater are not damaged, although the columns and the beams of the central portico lie in ruins, as did the krater in the opposite portico. Just in front of the portico (10:33) is yet another sculpture, which can represent the popular in the early Empire period archaic forms of representations of deities, such as the statue of Apollo from Casa del Menandro

⁷ Roma, Musei Vaticani, Galleria dei Candelabri 2404 (IDAI Objects Arachne 20035: <http://arachne.uni-koeln.de/arachne>), cf. Amelung 1995: I, 387–9, No. 242.

⁸ Roma, Musei Vaticani, Galleria Chiaramonti 2006 (IDAI Objects Arachne 20131), cf. Grassinger, 1991: 205, No. 45.

⁹ Roma, Musei Vaticani, Galleria Chiaramonti 2006 (IDAI Objects Arachne 20131), cf. Amelung 1995: I, 387–9, No. 122, taf. 40.

in Pompeii (I, 10, 4).¹⁰ Among the remaining equipment of the villa are hermai typical of the end of the 1st century BCE and the early Empire period, arranged in the garden and inside the house (9:05), as well as a table on supports in the form of gryphons,¹¹ a bronze tripod with a container for the fire used for lighting – in the film, a place for burning sacrifices to Pluto,¹² and a bronze candelabrum.¹³ In this room there is also a lararium, therefore it may be assumed that this was an atrium space – this would also be explained by the presence of large-sized tripod with an open fire. In the fourth episode (1:01:00), there appear other elements of villa interior equipment, such as Roman bed with a footstool and a Greek klismos¹⁴. The Batto family is shown in clothes that generally reflect the Roman style. They wear tunics with patterned borders and a pallium thrown over them. In the case of the servants (5:50) – in a non-Roman fashion – the tunics are worn in layers, shorter over longer, and they are distinguished by very original, large patterns, such as stripes and polka dots. A reference to a much older tradition are the sakkos caps, Greek head coverings often seen in South Italian ceramics.¹⁵

The image of Carthage in the film *Cabiria* is not burdened by the desire to faithfully present the appearance of the city, since it was – and still is – impossible to accomplish because of the limited number of finds from pre-Roman times. Nevertheless, the production designer's intention was, as it seems, to present the exotic atmosphere of an ancient city, which, with the use of the elements of Eastern, Egyptian, Greek and Roman art was, in our opinion, carried out quite satisfactorily, although certainly fragments of architecture and interior design of the Roman villa were presented in the most precise manner. We omit here, of course, chronological issues, which were not taken into account in presenting any of the cities, and the monuments are combined in a rather arbitrary fashion.

Cabiria shows also for a brief moment the figure of Hannibal, a bearded, leather-clad man standing on the mountain peak while crossing the Alps. He is completely different from both the probable numismatic images (Villaronga 1973: 48–51; Picard 1983–1984: 77; Miles 2011: 267) as well as earlier ancient representations in sculpture (Charles-Picard 1971: 80–83) and painting and later images presented in films and comics.

Almost a hundred years later after *Cabiria*, in 2012, the second season of the acclaimed HBO series *Game of Thrones*, based on George R.R. Martin's saga *A Song of Ice and Fire*, shows a city of Qarth, a city of rich merchants modelled on Carthage, whose certain elements resemble those presented in a 1994 French

¹⁰ Museo Archeologico Nazionale in Naples Inv. 146103 (IDAI Objects Arachne 53200).

¹¹ Cf. Roma, Musei Vaticani, Museo Gregoriano Profano 9873 (IDAI Objects Arachne 21757).

¹² Cf. a tripod in the Museo Archeologico Nazionale in Naples, see Hamlin 1916: pl. X.

¹³ See examples Museo Archeologico Nazionale in Naples (Aßkamp et al. 2007: 230, no. 4.7.7).

¹⁴ E.g. red figure cup by the Eretria Painter (440–435 BCE), Louvre G 457, Lezzi-Hafter 1988: 32, fig. 6A, C–D, 77, fig. 20A, pls. 16, 53B, no. 21.

¹⁵ E.g. Apulian oinochoe, 325–300 BCE, cf. Bulas 1935: pl. 16[70] 2 a–b.

comic *Barca* by Simon Rocca and Michel Suro as well as 19th century paintings by J.M.W. Turner. It is one of less noticeable elements of the ancient world used by the author of the saga. The two latter references (in the TV series and in the comic) present the latest creation of Carthage image in terms of *licentia graphica*.

The first time we see the city of Qarth is in the episode 204 called 'Garden of Bones' (37:24). It is the city of merchants, situated by the sea, on Essos, the wealthiest continent and the garden of bones of the title euphemistically refers to the desert surrounding Qarth, strewn with bones of those refused the entrance to the city. Its seaside location and desert surroundings, as well as all its riches and its mercantile character may actually reference the ancient Carthage, the new city – *Qart-ḥadašt* in Phoenician. However, the way it was imagined diverges greatly from the Roman or Phoenician models. A common characteristic, shared by both cities, is that Carthage was located on a trade route from the east to the west through the Mediterranean Sea, which allowed its residents to maintain control over the sea and to greatly benefit from trading. Qarth's fortifications may be a reflection of reconstructed walls surrounding Babylon¹⁶, the fragments of which are preserved in the Pergamon Museum in Berlin, and the form of the city gate could be based on a model as well – the Ishtar Gate from the 6th century BCE,¹⁷ with a vaulted passageway and two flanking towers, but built of mud brick, instead of stone, as shown in the film¹⁸. The oval shape of the city located in a narrow harbour (3:10) is different from the historical location of Carthage – built on a promontory, surrounded by water from two sides and secured from land by city walls. A narrow harbour in the film reminds of a characteristically extended entrance to the port, established on a central plan (Connolly 1998: 269).

The portrayal of the city itself, house furnishing and outfits references a universal vision of a rich Eastern city, without the possibility of tracking down any references to the ancient times. In Qarth the ancient hill of Byrsa was replaced by the monumental tower of the House of the Undying.

The city of Qarth with its climate of a south-located port town taken straight from the paintings of Joseph Mallord William Turner carries a true resemblance to Carthage. Turner painted two pictures connected with the topic of Carthage¹⁹.

¹⁶ <http://www.crystalinks.com/Fortress.html> [accessed 30.04.2015]

¹⁷ Cf. *supra*.

¹⁸ Such type of walls appear also in the comics depictions of the city. Interestingly, Appian and Florus claim that the walls of Carthage were triple: Flor. 1, 31, 11; App. *Lib.* 449–450 and 456. See also reconstructions: Niemeyer 2004: 39; Charles-Picard 1962: 18–20.

¹⁹ See: 'Dido Directing the Equipment of the Fleet, or the Morning of the Carthaginian Empire' (Coll. Turner Bequest, Tate Britain London, exhibited 1828, oil paint on board mounted canvas, 147x226 cm, N00506); and also: 'Dido and Aeneas' (Coll. Turner Bequest, Tate Britain London, exhibited 1814, oil paint on canvas, 146x237 cm, N00494); 'Mercury Sent to Admonish Aeneas' (Coll. Turner Bequest, Tate Britain London, exhibited 1850, oil paint on canvas, 90x120 cm, N00553); 'The Visit to the Tomb' (Coll. Turner Bequest, Tate Britain London, exhibited 1850, oil paint on canvas, 91x121 cm, N00555); 'The Departure of the Fleet' (Coll. Turner Bequest, Tate

One, presented in the National London Gallery called ‘Dido building the Carthage or the Rise of Carthaginian Empire’ painted in 1815²⁰ and the other, also shown in London, in Tate Britain titled ‘The Decline of the Carthaginian Empire’ from 1817²¹. As Philip Hardie noticed (2014: 207), their composition is closely modelled on Claude Lorrain’s ‘Seaport with the Embarkation of the Queen of Sheba’ from 1648²². Both Turner’s pictures show a city by the sea with many buildings on each side, as well as arches and colonnades and exotic plants growing on the roofs of multi-storey buildings. Water and sun are situated in the central part of the painting. Compared with the slide from *Game of Thrones*, episode 205, one may notice numerous similarities despite different, more distant perspective – water is placed a bit further back but still fairly centrally. The plants grow on the roofs of multi-storey buildings and the city itself is pretty impressive, its power quite overwhelming. Just like the power of Carthage, described by Velleius Paterculus as ‘the rival of the power of Rome’²³. In the series, Qarth is commonly referred to as ‘the greatest city that ever was or will be’. The pride of being its citizen is almost hybris-like. Apart from those loose associations through the concept of the city of merchants, Qarth can be compared to Carthage as a home of cunning and deceit widely practised by its inhabitants. First of all Daenerys Targaryen, who had been roaming the desert with baby dragons and whatever was left of Dothrakis army was informed that the city would welcome her with open arms, which turned out not to be exactly true. Secondly, the wealthiest merchant, Xaro Xhoan Daxos, who offered Daenerys half of his apparently empty treasury in exchange for her hand in marriage and the Iron Throne in later perspective, turned out to be nothing but a dragon thief, traitor, liar and a bankrupt. The proverbial term *Punicae artes* (Dubuisson 1983: 159–167) fits perfectly, as does the verb *simulare* commonly associated with the Carthaginians.

Britain London, exhibited 1850, oil paint on canvas, 89x120 cm, N00554); ‘Aeneas and the Sibyl, Lake Avernus’ (Coll. Turner Bequest, Tate Britain London, c. 1798, oil paint on canvas, 76x98 cm, N00463); ‘The Golden Bough’ (Coll. Turner Bequest, Tate Britain London, exhibited 1834, oil paint on canvas, 104x163 cm, N00371); ‘Æneas Relating his Story to Dido’ (Formerly Tate Britain London; presumed destroyed before 1936; exhibited 1850, oil paint on canvas, 91x122 cm, N00552); ‘Lake Avernus: Aeneas and the Cumaean Sibyl’ (Yale Center for British Art, Paul Mellon Collection, c. 1814–1815, oil paint on canvas, 71x97 cm). About Carthaginian-themed paintings: Finley 1999: 63 ff.

²⁰ ‘Dido building the Carthage or the Rise of Carthaginian Empire’ (Coll. Turner Bequest, National Gallery London, exhibited 1815, oil paint on canvas, 155,5x230 cm, NG498).

²¹ ‘The Decline of the Carthaginian Empire – Rome being determined on the Overthrow of her Hated Rival, demanded from her such Terms as might either force her into War, or ruin her by Compliance: the Enervated Carthaginians, in their Anxiety for Peace, consented to give up even their Arms and their Children’ (Coll. Turner Bequest, Tate Britain London, exhibited 1817, oil paint on canvas, 170x238,5 cm, N00499).

²² [...] in his will Turner asked that his two paintings should be hung in the National Gallery beside Claude’s *Seaport* and also Claude’s ‘Landscape with the Marriage of Isaac and Rebecca’.

²³ Vell. Pat. 1, 12, 6 [transl. Frederick W. Shipley].

The presentation of merchants of the city of Qarth differs slightly from the cinema iconography thusfar. In *Cabiria* they were more like the merchants of east. Also Italian film *Hannibal* of 1959 features a merchant; actually the film was made in two versions one for non-English speaking Europe and the other for English-speaking countries. Naturally, the most famous merchant is Hanno from Plautus's comedy called *Poenulus* (Franko 1996: 425–452; Starks Jr. 2000: 163–186; Blume 2004: 206 ff.). The merchants in *Game of Thrones* are shown in long sashed robes, however, they are not wearing any earrings. What we learn from the characters of *Game of Thrones* is that the richest inhabitants of Qarth are The Spice King, The Silk King and The Copper King, the owners of commercial fleet.

The image of Carthage presented here is more (*Game of Thrones*) or less (*Cabiria*) loosely connected with an image of an ancient city. It is rather supposed to refer to the city of barbarians (*Cabiria*) or symbolise the exotic (*Game of Thrones*). Thus, it is more historiophotic than historiographic. However, following all the ancient motifs, references and inspirations is a fascinating task for both a philologist and an archaeologist. We sincerely hope that we managed to give you more than a glimpse of that fascination.

Bibliography

- Ameling, W. (2004). *Der Staat und der Krieg*. In: S. Peters, ed., *Hannibal ad portas. Macht und Reichtum Karthagos*. Stuttgart: Theiss, 88–95.
- Amelung, W. (1995). *Die Skulpturen des Vatikanischen Museums*. Berlin: Reimer.
- Abkamp, R. et al. (2007). *Luxus und Dekadenz*. Mainz: Philipp von Zabern.
- Blume, H.-D. (2004). *Hanno und das Punische Personal im Poenulus*. In: Th. Baier, ed., *Studien zu Plautus' Poenulus*, Tübingen: Narr, 203–214.
- Bulas, K. (1935). *Corpus Vasorum Antiquorum*. Varsovie-Cracovie: Gebethner et Wolff.
- Charles-Picard, G. (1971). *Hannibal*, transl. Z. Stein. Warszawa: PIW.
- Charles-Picard, G. & C. (1962). *Życie codzienne w Kartaginie w czasach Hannibala*, transl. I. Wiczorkiewicz. Warszawa: PIW.
- Cintas, P. (1950). *Ceramique punique*. Paris: Institut des Hautes Études de Tunis.
- Connolly, P. (1998). *Greece and Roman at War*. London: Greenhill Books.
- Dorgerloh, A. (2013). *Competing ancient worlds in early historical film: the example of Cabiria (1914)*. In: P. Michelakis and M. Wyke, eds., *The Ancient World in Silent Cinema*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 229–246.
- Dubuisson, M. (1983). *L'Image du Carthaginois dans la littérature latine*. In: E. Gubel, E. Lipiński, B. Servais-Soyez, eds., *Studia Phoenicia*, vol. I–II («Orientalia Lovaniensia Analecta» 15). Leuven: Peeters, 159–167.
- Fantar, M.H. (1995). *Carthage. La cite Punique*. Paris: CNRS.
- Fantar, M.H. (2002). *Le Tophet de Salammbô*. In: C. Briand-Ponsart, S. Crogiez, eds., *L'Afrique du Nord Antiquité et Médiévale. Mémoire, identité et imaginaire*. Rouen: Presses Universitaires de Rouen, 13–24.
- Fergola, L. (ed.) (2004). *Oplontis e le sue ville*. Pompei: Flavius.
- Finley, G. (1999). *Angel in the Sun. Turner's Vision of History*. Montreal & Kingston – London – Ithaca: McGill – Queen's University Press.

- Fiorina, P. (2006). *Cartagine, teatro dell'immaginario. Su alcune tracce archeologiche nei film muti italiani di ambientazione punica*. In: S. Alvisio, A. Barbera, eds., *Cabiria&Cabiria*, Turin, Milan: Il Castoro/Museo Nazionale del Cinema.
- Flaubert, G. (2008). *Salambo*, transl. W. Rogowicz. Warszawa: Hachette Livre Polska.
- Franko, G.F. (1996). 'The Characterization of Hanno in Plautus' Poenulus'. *AJP*, 117, 425–452.
- Frazer, A. (ed.) (1998). *The Roman Villa: villa urbana*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Galpin, F. W. (1929). 'The Sumerian Harp of Ur, c. 3500 B.C.'. *Oxford Journal of Music and Letters*, X, 108–123.
- García Morcillo, M. (2015). *The East in the West. The Rise and Fall of Carthage in Modern Imagery and Film*. In: M. García Morcillo, P. Hanesworth, O. Lapeña Marchena, eds., *Imagining Ancient Cities in Film: From Babylon to Cinecittà*. New York – London: Routledge, 135–162.
- Grassinger, D. (1991). *Römische Marmorkratere*. («Monumenta Artis Romanae», XVIII). Mainz: Philipp von Zabern.
- Hamlin, A.D.F. (1916). *A History of Ornament*. New York: Cooper Square Publ.
- Hardie, P. (2014). *The Last Trojan Hero. A Cultural History of Virgil's Aeneid*. London – New York: I.B. Tauris.
- Hoyos, D. (2011). *Truceless War. Carthage's Fight for Survival, 241 to 237 BC*. Leiden – Boston: Brill.
- Kunze, M. (ed.) (1995). *Kurzführer Pergamonmuseum. Antikensammlung, Vorderasiatisches Museum*. Mainz: Philipp von Zabern Verlag.
- Lezzi-Hafter, A. (1988). *Der Eretria-Maler, Werke und Weggefahrten*. Mainz: Philipp von Zabern.
- Lipiński, E. (2013). *Studia z dziejów i kultury starożytnego Bliskiego Wschodu*. Kraków: Zakład Wydawniczy »NOMOS«.
- Lipiński, E. (1988). *Sacrifices d'enfants a Carthage et dans le monde semitique oriental*. In: E. Lipiński, ed., *Studia Phoenicia VI. Carthago* («Orientalia Lovaniensia Analecta» 26, nr 2). Leuven: Peeters Press, 162–182.
- Mekhitarian, A. (1992). *Malarstwo egipskie*. Warszawa: Skira.
- Miczka, T. (2009). *Kino włoskie*. Gdańsk: słowo / obraz tertoria.
- Miles, R. (2011). *Hannibal and Propaganda*. In: D. Hoyos, ed., *A Companion to the Punic Wars*. Chichester – Malden: Wiley–Blackwell, 260–279.
- Moscatti, S. (1968). *Świat Fenicjan*, transl. M. Gawlikowski. Warszawa: PWN.
- Niemeyer, H.G. (2004). *Mythos und Geschichte, Orient und Okzident*. In: S. Peters, ed., *Hannibal ad portas. Macht und Reichtum Karthagos*. Stuttgart: Theiss, 38–51.
- Pelletier-Hornby, P. (1995). *Salammô: La Carthage de Flaubert*. In: *Carthage. L'Histoire, sa trace et son écho*. Paris: Paris Musées, 138–144.
- Picard, G. (1983–1984). 'Hannibal hegemon hellénistique'. *RSA*, 13–14, 75–81.
- Shelby Brown, S. (1992). *Late Carthaginian Child Sacrifice and Sacrificial Monuments in their Mediterranean Context*. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press.
- Śliwa, J. (1970). 'Egipskie figurki brązowe w Muzeum Narodowym w Krakowie'. *Rozprawy i Sprawozdania Muzeum Narodowego w Krakowie*, X, 21–37.
- Śliwa, J. (1987). 'Zabytki egipskie ze zbiorów Muzeum Narodowego w Krakowie, część II'. *Studia i materiały archeologiczne* 5, 97–217.
- Starks Jr., J.H. (2000). 'Nullus me est hodie Poenus Poenior: Ballanced Ethnic Humor in Plautus' Poenulus'. *Helios*, 27, 163–186.
- Villaronga, L. (1973). *Las monedas hispano-cartaginesas*. Barcelona: Patrocinado por la Sección Numismática del Círculo Filatélico y Numismático.
- Ward-Perkins, J.B. (1981). *Roman Imperial Architecture*. Harmondsworth: Penguin Books.
- White, H. (1988). 'Historiography and historiophoty'. *The American Historical Review* 93, 1193–1199.
- White, H. (2014). *Historiografia i historiofotia*, transl. Ł. Zaremba. In: H. White, *Przeszłość praktyczna*. E. Domańska, ed. Kraków: Towarzystwo Autorów i Wydawców Prac Naukowych UNIVERSITAS, 255–266.